

META-ANALYSIS STUDY OF THE INFLUENCE OF ORGANIZATIONAL LEARNING AND ORGANIZATIONAL NORMS ON COMPETITIVENESS

Ramon Syahrial

Economics, 17 August 1945 University Surabaya, Indonesia
E-mail: 1272000040@surel.untag-sby-ac.id

Abstract

This type of research is a meta-analysis related to the impact of organizational learning and organizational norms on competitiveness. The data analyzed in a meta-analysis study are the same, as meta-analysis studies are generally aimed at inferring, integrating, and interpreting the results of previous researchers, and therefore the data are highly dependent on the primary study. Must have a configuration and a correlation pattern. They can be compared to each other. This survey was qualitatively conducted by reviewing 10 survey articles. The analysis was performed through comparisons between studies. The results of the analysis show that organizational learning and organizational norms affect an organization's competitiveness. The results show that organizational learning and organizational norms can be the driving force in maintaining and improving organizational competitiveness in the form of firms, banks and SMEs.

**Keywords: organizational learning and organizational norms,
competitiveness and meta analysis.**

INTRODUCTION

The competitiveness of corporate organizations in the current era of globalization is required to be higher. The survival of a business organization depends heavily on its ability to respond to change. Changes that generally take the form of quality improvements can be caused by a variety of forces, both internal and external. Competitiveness in the age of globalization is characterized by the presence of domestic and foreign competitors. In business, competition determines the success or failure of a company. According to Michael E. Porter (2008,:1) he states: "Competition is the essence of corporate success and failure." Therefore, in the increasingly fierce competition, every company is required to be competitive to other companies. The competitive environment and growing customer awareness are forcing all companies to rethink their strategies to stay ahead of their peers and competitors in their developments. Therefore, only companies have the right strategies to ensure competitiveness in unforeseen business situations. Strategy is essential for a company's survival.

Mooney, (2017) Competitive advantage stems from a firm's ability to leverage its internal strengths to respond to external environmental opportunities while avoiding external threats and internal weaknesses. In the same context, Bernie defines invincibility as the inability of another company to replicate its own resources. For this purpose, shortage is defined as a company resource that is not available to the company's current and future competitors. There has been much debate about the competitiveness of a business and many definitions related to competitiveness have been given. Some experts say: Competitiveness is the ability to determine the dimensions of market products that are suitable for a company's positioning (Ansoff in Rifki Mohamad's 2020). Similarly, Porter (1985) argues in his book that competitiveness is the ability of competitors to perform certain activities economically or with better quality/service than their competitors, or a combination of both. It is an attempt to create better customer value than.

Competitiveness can also come from company resources. This perspective is known as the Resource Based View (RBV) created by Penrose (1959) in Hamed (2009). According to him, competitiveness is achieved by economies of scale, improving management skills and technical capabilities (Penrose, 1959, in Hamed, 2009). A good image evokes trust, attracting consumers to repurchase or remain loyal to the product, and consumers will not switch to other products offering similar products. According to Tulus Tambunan (2001: 25), there are some things that every business must learn or own in order to gain a competitive advantage. For example, technology, advanced entrepreneurship, quality and quality of the products produced, good technology and not. Technical service. (After-sales service), skill / education level workforce, work ethic, creativity and high motivation, innovation, ample capital and other facilities and infrastructure.

With reference to the above statement, researchers are interested in research using meta-analytic techniques that focus on organizational norms regarding organizational learning and competitiveness, based on some previous research. Organizational Learning Most studies to date have shown that organizational learning is a key determinant of corporate innovation outcomes (Calantone, Cavusgil & Zhao, 2002; Tushman & Nadler, 1986). Organizational learning not only enables businesses to generate innovative skills (Jiménez-Jiménez & Sanz-Valle, 2011), but also supports creativity (Yli-Renko, Autio, & Sapienza, 2001). Stimulate new knowledge and ideas and improve comprehension. Then implement these ideas (Damanpour, 1991). Therefore, the deeper the innovation, the higher the level of learning required (Garcia-Lares, Jimenez-Vario Nuevo, Gutierrez-Gutierrez, 2012). Smith (2008) Companies that can harness their knowledge faster tend to be competitive leaders in the business world. Ba Puji and Crossan (2004) consider organizational learning to be an important area of organizational management and research.

There are concerns that the development and mastery of technology that is not overshadowed or constrained by full moral values tends to encourage people to do undesirable things. This also happens in competition in the business world without building moral values. We will do whatever it takes to win the competition, regardless of views or constraints. This is the same as what was

conveyed by Jacobs and Everett (in Suroto, 2014: 587) `Norma is a mental vehicle for the organization related to what each board or member of the organization should and should not do`. This view shows that norms are the organization's spiritual means of what each manager or member of the organization should and should not do. Robbins (in Suroto, 2014: 587) states, "The norms relate to how hard organization managers should work, productivity, and communication methods, so these aspects are the roles of managers and organizations. Strongly affects. "

Based on the above explanation, competitiveness is still a research topic involving organizational learning and organizational normative variables, and is rarely the focus of research, especially in terms of competitiveness. A meta-analytic study of. Organizational norms for competitiveness.

METHOD

This research uses a meta-analysis method by reviewing several articles in national and international journals that can be accessed online. This meta-analysis study used a sample of 10 relevant articles in national and international journals related to the effect of organizational learning and organizational norms on competitiveness. The keywords used in this article search are organizational learning, organizational norms and competitiveness. In the research, besides using national journals and international journals, libraries and books are also used as data sources.

The systematics of the meta-analysis review includes several stages, as follows (Anadiroh, 2019:24):

Table 1. Meta-analysis stages

Systematic	Explanation
Determine research topics (topic formulation)	Determine centered topics, and objective
Determine the sample	Consideration of all relevant research
Collecting data	Data comes from research studies published
Analyze data results	Describe the results in Qualitative forms, tables, and graphs

Ppulation and Sample

The population taken in this study was a journal article on publishing scientific papers both national and international scale with topics related to the influence of organizational learning on competitiveness and organizational norms on competitiveness.

Data Collection Techniques And Research Instruments

Data collection/literature is carried out using electronic journals to obtain national journals and international journals with the results of research on the influence of organizational learning and organizational norms on competitiveness.

After conducting an analysis of the articles obtained, the results of the study were then grouped into Table 2 below.

Table 2 Article Group Mapping

Article Criteria	Article Group	Number of Articles
Organizational Learning to Competitiveness		
Journal Year	1. 2009	1
	2. 2013	1
	3. 2018	1
	4. 2021	1
	5. 2021	1
Types of Research	1. Qualitative, analysis and integration of theory to develop conceptual models.	1
	2. Quantitative cross-sectional design, analysis using Smart PLS 3 (SEM).	1
	3. Quantitative, Multiple Regression, data are analyzed using SPSS software.	3
Research Object	1. Owner / Manager of Manufacturing Company in Iraq	1
	2. CEO from various organizations in Pakistan	1
	3. Employees of Oil Company in Pakistan	1
	4. GT PLC Bank Employees in Nigeria	1
	5. Manager and Owner of SME	1
Organizational Norms to Competitiveness		
Journal Year	1. 2003	1
	2. 2011	1
	3. 2018	1
	4. 2019	1
	5. 2020	1
Types of Research	1. Quantitative, using the coefficient and Cronbach confirmation, analysis with SEM PLS	1
	2. Qualitative with literature study	1
	3. Quantitative, analysis using SPSS	1
	4. Quantitative, survey with a 7 -point Likert scale, hierarchical regression with SPSS.	1
	5. Quantitative, Reliability with Alpha Cronbach, Linear Regression through	1

Article Criteria	Article Group	Number of Articles
	the help of SPSS version 23.0	
Research Object	1. International trade lawyers and manufacturing company marketing managers	1
	2. Literature and various studies	1
	3. Company employees in India	1
	4. Employees from 89 companies in India	1
	5. Customers from three banks in India	1

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In this study in accordance with the purpose of the number of journal articles used as consideration is 10 articles.

Table 3. Article Grouping

Object	Type of Organization			Total
	Company	Bank	SME	
Owner/CEO/Leader	3		1	4
Employee	3	1		4
Customer/Consumer		1		1
Journal/Literature Articles				1
Types of Research	Quantitative			8
	Qualitative			2

From the group grouping table above that the 10 articles used as referral material in this study, consisting of 3 articles with the object of research are owners/ CEOs/ leaders in a company and one research object is the owner of a small and medium business, then the object of other journal articles are 3 articles of research objects are company employees and one employee articles from banks, one banking customer article and one article in the form of literature studies. Of the 10 journal articles, all of them use variable dependent competitiveness.

Table 4. Journal Article Analysis Results

No.	Article Title	Results
Organizational Learning to Competitiveness		
1	Strategic Positioning For Sustainable Competitive Advantage: An Organizational Learning Approach	So that the organization remains competitive must invest in developing the ability to learn sustainable organizations
2	Exploring and Measuring Organizational Learning Capability and Competitive Advantage of Petroleum Industry Firms	Organizational learning provides a significant contribution to the achievement of competitive advantage
3	Empowerment As A Strategy To Achieve The Competitive Advantage Of Organizations: A Mediating Role	Organizational learning is very helpful for managing company resources and maintaining competitive advantage

No.	Article Title	Results
	Of Organizational Learning	
4	Effect Of Organizational Learning And Effectiveness On The Operations, Employees Productivity And Management Performance	The results showed that learning and organizational effectiveness had a significant positive relationship with bank operations and this was because organizational learning was a commitment to continue the operation of the bank that was effective to its customers.
5	Firm Competitiveness in Small Medium Enterprises in Starehe Sub-County in Kenya: What Role Does Organizational Learning Play?	Organizational learning has a statistically significant influence on the company's competitiveness. The implication of this result is that at a 95% confidence level, organizational learning has a positive effect on the competitiveness of SME companies in Strehe District.
Organizational Norms to Competitiveness		
1	Manufacturer Governance Of Foreign Distributor Relationships: Do Relational Norms Enhance Competitiveness In The Export Market?	In addition to the direct influence between relational norms and producer competitiveness in the export market, a significant finding is an indirect effect through the role of mediation of trust. This finding reveals that relational norms affect the competitiveness of the company in the export market through a process of mutual trust.
2	Impact of Organizational Change to Achieve Competitive Edge	Changes depending on the conditions and problems faced by the organization in the workplace are mostly influenced by three factors, namely employee commitment, peak management and organizational culture support. By focusing on these three factors, the organization can easily manage the process of change and gain competitive advantage.
3	The Impact of Service Ethics on Organizational competitiveness In India - A Primary Approach To The Startup and Emerging Service Enterprises	Small pioneering companies emphasize revenue collection (Mishra, Dalvi, Sahni, and Verma, 2014) have been rejected and alternative hypotheses, namely, Indian service companies greatly recognize the existence of ethics even in the competitive business environment today, has been received by the results of study.
4	Competitiveness Improvement In Public Sector Organizations: What They Need?	The Bangladesh public sector company approved the positive impact of internal marketing on the positive work of employee attitudes at the workplace, which in turn increased competitiveness.
5	Marketing Ethics And Competitiveness: A Study Of Deposit Money Bank In Nigeria	The findings reveal that transparency is the only ethical dimension that has a positive and significant effect on the competitiveness of companies in the banking industry. Further results show that honesty and

No.	Article Title	Results
		autonomy have a negative influence on individuals but significantly on the competitiveness of the organization.

In table 4 above it can be seen that the effect of organizational learning variables on competitiveness with the object of the owner's research/owner of the company contained in two journals and owners of the SMEs used in this study, that organizational learning will have an influence if the company dares to invest and there is a contribution significant from the organization's learning process this is the same as the results of Ogundele's research, (2005) and Research Erdogan, et al., (2006). While the influence of organizational learning on competitiveness with other objects, namely employees both in companies and banks produce that organizational learning is a commitment and assisting employees in the process of managing their tasks and responsibilities in maintaining competitiveness with other companies.

In Table 4 above, we can also explain that the effect of organizational norms on competitiveness which is divided into several research objects, namely for research results with the object of research of the company, that organizational norms will affect the competitiveness if the organizational norms have the value of the trust indicated by the leader relationship organization with organizational stakeholders. While the effect of organizational norms on competitiveness with the object of research of an employee of a company will affect if the organizational norms have been well developed in the internal organization and this also applies to pioneering companies or newly developing companies. For the influence of organizational norms on competitiveness with bank customer research objects, according to them the organizational norms are in the form of openness in providing services and delivery of information to bank customers. Finally, the results of the literature study related to the effect of organizational norms on competitiveness is that competitiveness will depend on the conditions and problems faced by the organization in the workplace mostly influenced by three factors, namely employee commitment, top management and organizational culture support. By focusing on these three factors, the organization can easily manage the process of change and gain competitive advantage.

CONCLUSION

From the process of grouping journal data collected by 10 journal articles for this research, the researcher draws the conclusion that the influence of organizational learning and organizational norms on competitiveness has different values if the research objects from research conducted are also different. From several articles that are used as research objects, it can be concluded that the research object from a company environment will result in that there is no demand for transparency and not talking about honesty. In banking organizations and SMEs not only produce organizational learning and organizational norms affect competitiveness but also maintain trust and continue to behave honestly that is desirable in increasing competitiveness.

The limitation in this study is not to discuss the reasons and intentions of researchers in choosing the type of research. The second limitation, this research has not used the latest research data from online journal articles, because researchers have difficulty collecting from journal sources related to research variables.

REFERENCES

Adetayo, et al (2020). "Marketing Ethics And Competitiveness: A Study Of Deposit Money Bank In Nigeria". *Skyline Business Journal*, 16(1), 01-12 (ISSN 1998-3425).

Anadiroh, M. (2019). *Studi Meta-Analisis Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning (PBL)*. Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Jakarta.

Bapuji, H., & Crossan, M. (2004). From Questions to Answers: Reviewing Organizational Learning Research. *Management Learning*, 35(4), 397–417.

Calantone, R. J., Cavusgil, S. T., & Zhao, Y. (2002). Learning orientation, firm innovation capability, and firm performance. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 31, 515–524.

Damanpour F. (1991). Organizational Innovation: A Meta-Analysis of Effects of Determinants and Moderators. *The Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 34, No. 3, pp. 555-590.

Erdogan B. Et al (2006). Justice And Leader-Member Exchange: The Moderating Role Of Organizational Culture. *Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 49, No. 2, 395–406.

Fatma Zerah Tan F Z et al (2021). "Effect Of Organizational Learning And Effectiveness On The Operations, Employees Productivity And Management Performance". *jurnal Journal of Management Emerald Publishing Limited 0973-1954*.

García-Morales V.J. et al (2012). Transformational Leadership Influence On Organizational Performance Through Organizational Learning And Innovation. *Journal of Business Research*. Volume 65, Issue 7, Pages 1040-1050.

Hameed, Imran. 2009. Sources of Business Competitive Advantage: A Review. *Journal of Business & Economics*. July-December. Pp. 222-233

Iqbal R. (2011). "Impact of Organizational Change to Achieve Competitive Edge". *jurnal European Journal of Business and Management* , Vol 3, No.4

Jahanshahi A A. Et al (2019). "Competitiveness Improvement In Public Sector Organizations: What They Need?". *jurnal J Public Affairs*. 2019.

Jiménez-Jiménez et al (2011). Innovation, Organizational Learning, And Performance. *Journal of Business Research* 64 - 408–417.

Kanda R. Et al (2018). "The Impact of Service Ethics on Organizational competitiveness In India - A Primary Approach To The Startup and Emerging Service Enterprises". *International Journal of Business Ethics in Developing Economies* 7 (1), 13-22.

Lockwood J, Mooney A (2017) Computational thinking in education: where does it fit? A systematic literary review. arXiv preprint arXiv:1703.07659. Ireland: Maynooth University.

Njuguna J.I. (2009). "Strategic Positioning For Sustainable Competitive Advantage: An Organizational Learning Approach". jurnal KCA Journal Of Business Management: Vol. 2, Issue 1.

Naveed Akhtar N., et al (2013). "Exploring and Measuring Organizational Learning Capability and Competitive Advantage of Petroleum Industry Firms". jurnal International Business and Management Vol. 6, No. 1, pp. 89-103.

Ocharo M O et al (2021). "Firm Competitiveness in Small Medium Enterprises in Starehe Sub-County in Kenya: What Role Does Organizational Learning Play?". jurnal International Journal of Managerial Studies and Research (IJMSR) Volume 9, Issue 11, PP 32-44.

Ogundele, O.J.K. 2005 Management and organization: theory and behaviour. Lagos: Molofin Nominees.

Rabab Ibrahim Kadhim R.I., et al (2018). "Empowerment As A Strategy To Achieve The Competitive Advantage Of Organizations: A Mediating Role Of Organizational Learning". jurnal Management Science Letters 8, 903–912.

Rifki Mohamad et al (2020). Analisis Strategi Daya Saing (Competitive Advantage) Kopia Karanji Gorontalo. Oikos-Nomos: Jurnal Kajian Ekonomi Dan Bisnis. Volume 13, Nomor 1. Pp 1-14.

Porter, M. (2008). Competitive Advantage (Keunggulan Bersaing): Menciptakan dan Mempertahankan Kinerja Unggul. Kharisma Publishing. Tangerang.

Porter, M. 1985. Competitive Advantage. The Free Press, New York.

Smith, L. (2008). South African Social Work education: Critical imperatives for social change in the post-apartheid and post-colonial context. International Social Work, 51(3):371-383.

Suroto (2014). Kecenderungan Pengurus Dalam Mentaati Norma Organisasi Kemahasiswaan. Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan : Volume 4, Nomor 8, pp 586-593.

Tambunan, T.H., Tulus, Dr., 2001, Perekonomian Indonesia, Teori dan Temuan Empiris, Jakarta : Ghalia Indonesia.

Tushman, M. L., & Nadler, D. A. (1986). Organizing for innovation. California Management Review, 28(3), 74– 92.

Yli-Renko H. Et al (2001). Social Capital, Knowledge Acquisition, and Knowledge Exploitation in Young Technology-Based Firms. Strategic Management Journal 22(6-7):587 - 613

Zhang C, et al (2003). "Manufacturer Governance Of Foreign Distributor Relationships: Do Relational Norms Enhance Competitiveness In The Export Market?". Journal of International Business Studies 34, 550–566.